#### **Action Item Notes**

## **Effectiveness Monitoring Committee Meeting**

# August 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2016 USFS/CAL FIRE Northern Operations Headquarters Redding, CA

Participants (17): Dr. Russ Henly (Co-Chair), Stuart Farber (Co-Chair), Dr. Kevin Boston, Drew Coe, Ali Dunn, Nick Harrison, Don Lindsay, Matt Dias, René LeClerc, Tom Engstrom, Sal Chinnici, Dave Fowler, Clarence Hostler, Erin Kelly, Steve Baumgartner, Brett Furnas, Connor Pompa, Richard Gienger (online), Mike Fuller (online), and Chris Monary (online).

#### 1. Call to Order

# 2. Report by the Co-Chairs

- Stuart Farber summarized his EMC report given to the BOF on July 21<sup>st</sup> in Middletown, CA. Mr. Farber discussed the ranking process (draft Appendix F ranking sheet), and stated that his fellow Board members enjoyed the ranking sheet being summarized to one page. An extra column will be added to the draft Appendix F ranking sheet, which will state the budgetary request of each project.
- The EMC has a goal to update its Strategic Plan by the December 2016 Board meeting. Edits to the plan will be discussed at the October EMC meeting so they can be thoroughly vetted by the committee before they reach the full Board.
- Dr. Russ Henly spoke of the Campbell Creek Watershed Pilot Project that is being administered by the Timber Regulation and Forest Restoration Program. The application period for those seeking to be on the pilot study's advisory committee closed on July 22<sup>nd</sup>. Dr. Henly and the Timber Regulation and Forest Restoration Program leads will be reviewing applications, scheduling applicant interviews, and will be selecting advisory committee members soon.
- The Timber Regulation and Forest Restoration Program and Natural Resources Agency were successful in entering into an interagency agreement with the US Geological Survey for the acquisition of LiDAR data for the Central Mendocino County coastal area, totaling about 907 square miles (568,000 acres) and comprised of the Ten Mile River, Noyo River, Big River, Albion River, Lower Navarro River, and Alder Creek watersheds. This data will assist in the spatial analysis for the study. This LiDAR data also will be useful to researchers at the Jackson Demonstration State Forest, as well as other landowners and agencies in the area.

- Mr. Farber summarized the past EMC meeting in Ukiah on June 17<sup>th</sup>. Potential conflict of interest issues were raised regarding researchers involved in concept proposals who are also members of the EMC committee. It has been recommended that if a person is the primary investigator in the concept proposal, they should not be involved in the ranking process (i.e. abstain). This needs to be incorporated into the EMC Strategic Plan. Although, Dr. Henly did remind members that ranking the projects does not determine that they will be actually funded.
- The Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act (GOV. Code §11120 et seq.) requirements were also documented by the members, involving the posting of documents and ensuring transparency for the EMC proceedings.
- Contract administration and the awarding of funds for concept proposals. The Timber Regulation and Forest Restoration Fund (TRFRF) monies (\$425,000/year) for FYs 16/17 and 17/18 are being held within the Board's budget as a line item. The awards will be granted through the normal Board/CAL FIRE/State of CA procurement process. The contracts for implementation and monitoring efforts will be easiest if a contract agreement is done through a public interagency agreement or with a university/college institution. Obtaining these services through private entities usually requires more complex procurement processes. There was also discussion of Resource Conservation Districts (RCDs) being able to help assist via interagency agreements. All contracts that will be given out through this available funding will be on a reimbursement basis, although advance payment mechanisms are available.

# 3. <u>Presentation: Ecosystem Biodiversity Monitoring, Dr. Brett Furnas, California Department of Fish & Wildlife.</u>

Dr. Furnas gave an overview on studies involving wildlife monitoring and the
examination of population trends in response to disturbances such as climate
change, drought mortality and timber harvesting. The goal of these studies is
to inform conservation planning for the State of California, such as the State
Wildlife Action Plan, which was recently updated..

# 4. Review of Draft Appendix F.

• Mr. Farber went over the draft Appendix F ranking sheet that was presented to the Board in July. The Board Members added a few comments to the sheet to improve clarity and ease of understanding. The draft Appendix F was also changed from the synthesis of comments received at the June 17<sup>th</sup> Ukiah meeting. Board Member Marc Los Huertos wanted to see a clause added to Appendix F, advising researchers that their data and results will be publicly disseminated if actually awarded a grant from these funds. Dr. Boston

recommended that this not be in the draft Appendix F, but in the introductory statement of the Request for Proposals (RFP). EMC members discussed several edits to the draft Appendix F, including grammatical errors and reducing language to satisfy the clarity standard. A request was made by multiple EMC members to allow for payments from these funds to go toward experimental design development for concept proposals that receive high ranks from EMC members. Concept proposals that may be submitted to the EMC could likely involve research that is in its infancy, and sound statistical design and analysis would be key to determine the statistically valid sample sizes to ensure research accuracy and project ability to answer critical questions posed by the principal investigator.

#### 5. Review of Draft Letter for Requests for Proposals (RFPs)

- It was made clear by EMC members that the committee should entertain any concept proposals submitted, even if the proposal needs funding for experimental design before it can actually be initiated. Although questions were raised by Drew Coe, about what should happen to studies that need certain conditions before they can actually be completed (i.e. storm events, post-fire conditions). The committee considered these comments, and would deliberate on these proposals if they are received in the future.
- Dr. Boston and René LeClerc volunteered to be a sub-committee responsible for edits discussed on both the RFP and Appendix F. The committee decided to make the RFP document broader regarding the allocation of funds. The committee also agreed that the updated draft Appendix F, when finalized, should be linked within the RFP to help submitters of concept proposals better understand how projects will be ranked.
- Edits were directed to Dr. Boston to add a clause in the RFP that researchers who receive funding from these EMC monies must agree to make available their data and results available to the public.

#### 6. Review of Boggs Mountain Demonstration State Forest on-going research.

 Mr. Farber commended CAL FIRE FRAP Manager Dave Sapsis and Forester II/Hydrologist Drew Coe on research they have initiated at Boggs Mountain Demonstration State Forest in Cobb, CA after the destructive Valley Fire. Updates of on-going research and proposals for future research to be completed on Boggs can be found on the Board's website.

#### 7. Discussion of Membership

(a) Ali Dunn of the State Water Resources Control Board (SWRCB) was unanimously appointed by the full Board at the July 2016 meeting.

• EMC Executive Staff has been reaching out to universities, USFS, researchers, and members of the community with natural resource management backgrounds to help fill member vacancies within the EMC.

# 8. Public Forum

No comments received.

# 9. Discussion of location and future meeting dates.

- The next EMC meeting will be in Ukiah on October 13th.
- An EMC meeting planned for November will likely be held in Sacramento.
- Matt Dias stated that he is fine with moving locations and changing agendas, but he needs at least 10 days before the meeting to publish the agenda, to satisfy requirements of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.
- Matt Dias will send out a Doodle Poll for the November EMC meeting. The poll with give participants three options, either the week of Nov. 7<sup>th</sup>-11<sup>th</sup>, 14<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup>, or Nov. 21<sup>st</sup>-23<sup>rd</sup>.

# 10. Announcements: Scientific conferences, symposiums or workshops.

- The Wildlife Society Nevada Chapter Annual Meeting will be held February 7 10 in Reno, NV. (see: <a href="http://wildlife.org/nevada-chapter/annual-meeting/">http://wildlife.org/nevada-chapter/annual-meeting/</a>)
- The Wildlife Society, Oregon State Chapter Annual Meeting will also be hosted February 7-10 in Pendleton, OR. (see: <a href="https://ortws.wordpress.com/">https://ortws.wordpress.com/</a>)
- Soquel Demonstration State Forest will be hosting an Open House this Saturday, August 6. Researchers conducting work on the forest will be presenting their efforts to all those that attend. (see: <a href="http://www.soquelforest.com/">http://www.soquelforest.com/</a>)
- The Coast Redwood Forest Symposium will take place on September 21-23, Eureka, CA. (see: <a href="http://ucanr.edu/sites/Redwood2016/">http://ucanr.edu/sites/Redwood2016/</a>)
- The American Geophysical Union will be hosting its annual convention in San Francisco, CA from December 12-16th. Don Lindsay of the California Geological Survey, Dr. Joe Wagenbrenner of Michigan Technical University and Drew Coe from CAL FIRE will be presenting combined research at the convention. (see: https://fallmeeting.agu.org/2016/)

# 11. Adjournment